

Promoting investments and technology transfer in the renewable energy, energy efficiency (RE&EE) and environmental sector in West Africa

Regional Workshop on Financing and Investments in Mitigation Actions in West Africa

4 – 5 June 2012 - Accra, Ghana Summary of Proceedings

June 2012



Regional Workshop on Financing and Investments in Mitigation Actions in West Africa

Contract No: C 11015-024 Project No. WP1.10.1-7.024

Region: ECOWAS

Ву

Mr. Demba Diop Mr. Martin Zwanenburg

> Submitted by Particip GmbH



This document has been produced with the financial assistance of the European Union. The views expressed herein can in no way be taken to reflect the official opinion of the European Union nor of those of the ACP Secretariat.

REPORT COVER PAGE

Project Title:	Promoting investments and technology transfer in the renewable				
	energy, energy efficiency (RE West Africa	&EE) and environment	al sector in		
Project No.	WP1.10.1-7.024				
Region:	ECOWAS countries				
	Contracting Authority	Project Partner	<u>Contractor</u>		
Name:	BizClim - Programme Management Unit	ECOWAS Regional Center for Renewable Energy and Energy Efficiency (ECREE)	Particip GmbH		
Address:	Rue Belliard, 205 1040 Brussels Belgium	Achada Santo Antonio Electra Building, 2nd floor C.P. 288 Praia Cape Verde	Merzhauserstr. 183 79100 Freiburg Germany		
Tel. number:	+32 2 669 98 25 (switch)	+23 8 2604630	+49 761 790740		
Fax number:	+32 2 669 97 86		+49 761 7907490		
Email address:	Dominique@ ACPBusinessClimate.org	helayo@ecreee.org	Johannes.Ohnmacht @particip.de		
Contact persons:	Ms. Dominique Bourgault	Mr. Hyacinth Elayo	Mr. Johannes Ohnmacht		

Date of report: 18th of June 2012

Authors of report: Demba Diop, Martin Zwanenburg

Date of contract signature: 24/10/2011

Start of performance period: 09/11/2011

Project completion: 24/07/2012

The content of this report is the sole responsibility of the authors and can in no way be taken to reflect the views of the ECREEE, the European Union or the BizClim Programme.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

1.	EXEC	CUTIVE	SUMMARY 5
2.	THE	WORK	SHOP7
	2.1	DAY 1	- MONDAY 4 JUNE 2012 7
		2.1.1	Opening Ceremony - Honorable Mustapha Hamed, Deputy Minister for Environment
		2.1.2	Opening Ceremony - Dr. Mahama Kappiah, Executive Director of ECREEE
		2.1.3	Keynote Speech - Honorable Nusah Abdulai Fuseini, Deputy Minister for Energy
		2.1.4	Renewable Energy & Energy Efficiency in the ECOWAS Region - 2011 to 2016: The Role of ECREEE by Mr. Bah Saho, Renewable Energy Expert, ECREEE
		2.1.5	LOW Impact of CDM and Carbon Finance in WAF and implication for NAMAs by Mr. Demba Diop, Energy Expert, Team leader of the study
		2.1.6	NAMAs: examples, conditions and situation in WAF with emphasis on FIT by Mr. Martin Zwanenburg, Economist11
		2.1.7	The role of NAMA in financing a sustainable knowledge society in Cape Verde by Dr. Michael Knaus, IFAS12
		2.1.8	Early Experiences in the Development of Pilot NAMAs: Private Sector Involvement & Scaling Up Installation of Capacitor Banks by Mr. Daniel Tutu, EPA Ghana, and Kofi Agyarko, Energy Commission, Ghana
		2.1.9	Current NAMA developments and Kenya case study by Mr. Xander van Tilburg, Expert, ECN15
		2.1.10	NAMAs and Private Sector Involvement; Maximizing the chances to leverage private investment by Ms. Caroline de Vit, Expert, ECOFYS
		2.1.11	L How to finance NAMAs? International challenges and their consequences by Mr. Romain Morel, Consultant, CDC Climate Research, France

	2.1.12	2 Togo case study on Identifying the capacity and institutional needs for NAMAs by Pr. Ayite-Lo Ajavon Nse, Togo	17
	2.1.13	3 Financing and Investing in Mitigation Actions in West Africa by Paul van Aalst, SOVEC Management BV	18
2.2	DAY T	TWO: TUESDAY 5 JUNE 2012	19
	2.2.1	ECREEE road map for developing NAMA capacities and actions in the ECOWAS sub-region by Mr. Demba Diop, Energy Expert	19
	2.2.2	Financing and investment in mitigation actions in Africa: the AfDB experience by Dr. Nogoye Thiam, Climate Change Expert, AfDB	21
	2.2.3	NAMAs, Climate finance and Investments by Sean Doolan, DFID Ghana	22
	2.2.4	Closing Ceremony	24
	2.2.5	Main outcomes of the Workshop	24

1. EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

The ECOWAS Regional Centre for Renewable Energy and Energy Efficiency (ECREEE), in collaboration with the African Caribbean Pacific (ACP) Business Climate Facility (BizClim) jointly organized a two-day Regional Workshop on Financing and Investments in Mitigation Actions in West Africa.

The workshop was held against the background and experience gained with Clean Development Mechanisms (CDM) finance and renewable energy projects' successes and failures in West Africa and elsewhere.

The forum examined how policies, technologies, financing and capacity related bottlenecks to the development of Nationally Appropriate Mitigation Actions (NAMAs) in West African countries can be addressed to increase access to energy as an engine for growth and improve the competitiveness of African economies.

Specifically, the workshop had the following key objectives:

- Review RE&EE situation and sustainability in West Africa and identify key barriers and integration of experiences gained elsewhere;
- Review existing legislation, regulations procedures to assess selected ECOWAS countries' readiness for accessing NAMA related funds;
- Identify the type of NAMA actions that are most suitable and desirable for the region;
- Identify the related gaps and barriers and how they can be addressed;
- Identify capacity needs for enablers or facilitators, Designated National Authority(DNA) offices and other stakeholders;
- Discuss the proposal for the action plan and roadmap for promoting Financing and Investments in Mitigation Actions in West Africa;
- Engage stakeholders on issue-oriented discussions so as to share experience and agree on a common final plan of action.

The meeting brought together more than 30 high-level decision makers and experts to provide visible leadership and political commitment to a common strategy for successfully shaping vibrant NAMA activities in the region to scale up renewable energy and energy efficiency with the view to both increasing access to modern energy services and the sustainability of the sector.

The private sector was represented by the Federation of the West African chambers of commerce based in Abuja and several individual entrepreneurs in renewable energy.

To achieve the expected results of the workshop in particular and the project in general, a study on NAMAs in the region was prepared on the basis of a desk review and a field visit in 5 ECOWAS countries. Equally, a road map and a detailed action plan were drafted to enable ECREEE to take the necessary steps and measures in addressing the need for capacity development and expertise in the sub region.

Both the study report and the ECREEE road map and action plan were shared during the workshop in 3 separated presentations outlined as follow:

 The low impact of carbon finance in the region and implication for future development of NAMAs

- ii. NAMAs current status, condition and readiness in the region
- iii. ECREEE road map and action for developing capacity.

A summary of the ECREEE road map and Action Plan was printed and distributed to all the participants to facilitate its understanding and stimulate suggestions and comments to improve for its enrichment.

Besides the 3 presentations given by the Particip experts, key experts from reputable research, financial and government institutions provided valuable contributions in shaping the understanding of NAMAs; its current development and what could be done in West Africa. The presentations were given by high profile representatives of the Africa Development Bank, DFID (UK), Ecofys (Germany), ECN (The Netherlands), SOVEC (the Netherlands) and CDC (France). Leading countries such as Ghana and Togo could present their activities related to development of NAMA while aviation strike prevented the participation of several other countries among which Senegal, Cap Verde, Gambia, Guinée Bissau and Burkina Faso.

The achieved results can be outlined as follow:

- i. Provision of accurate and updated information for the participants on the current status of NAMAs and its development in West Africa,
- ii. An evaluation of the situation with carbon finance, renewable energy and energy efficiency in general in West Africa and its implication for NAMA development meaning the needed changes and the institutional, capacity and financial gaps to be addressed.
- iii. Recommendations on the issue of NAMA identification, development and finance and the related needs for capacity development for the regional and national actors for unlocking the potential
- iv. The adoption by the participants of an ECREEE road map and action plan for NAMAs development in the region
- v. Initial discussion between the African Development, DFID and ECREEE to develop, co finance and implement a regional NAMA capacity building project.

2. THE WORKSHOP

2.1 DAY 1 - MONDAY 4 JUNE 2012

2.1.1 Opening Ceremony - Honorable Mustapha Hamed, Deputy Minister for Environment

Honorable Mustapha Hamed, Deputy Minister for Environment, Science and Technology representing the Minister, gave the first speech.

In his address, the Deputy Minister explained that the sub-region is challenged with the interrelated and simultaneous challenges of energy access, energy security and climate change mitigation and adaptation. And although West Africa is so far responsible for only a fraction of global energy related GHG emissions, experts predict that the energy sector will be highly impacted by mitigation and adaptation costs of climate change in the forthcoming decades.

The Deputy Minister went on to say that the region has rich energy endowments, including vast hydro, solar, wind and bio-energy potentials, which should be tapped to unlock the economic potential of the ECOWAS region and effectively contribute towards poverty reduction. The scope and breadth of financing sources and instruments, both locally and internationally, must be increased to enable Nationally Appropriate Mitigation Actions (NAMAs) to take place. More creative leveraging of public and private sector resources will be needed to meet the financing requirements, including a variety of public and private sector sources.

While clean development mechanisms (CDM) and other carbon related finances offer huge opportunities for financing long-term sustainable development in the developing host countries, West African countries are yet to take advantage of these instruments due to the complexity of CDM procedures, the lengthy CDM project cycle, uncertainty of outcome as well as weak institutional and technical capacity.

The Deputy Minister expressed his pleasure at seeing so many high level experts gathered together to discuss the issues related to the creation of an enabling environment for investments and innovative finance in Nationally Appropriate Mitigation Actions particularly in the renewable energy, energy efficiency and transport sectors of ECOWAS member states.

The Deputy Minister concluded his address by commending ECREEE for its continued leadership and commitment in being a regional response to international Declarations, global climate change initiatives and to the specific needs of ECOWAS member states.

2.1.2 Opening Ceremony - Dr. Mahama Kappiah, Executive Director of ECREEE

The next address was presented by Dr. Mahama Kappiah, Executive Director of ECREEE

Dr Kappiah started his address by thanking the Government of Ghana and the ACP Business Climate Facility (BizClim) for their kind collaboration in organizing the workshop.

Dr. Kappiah explained that the workshop is the result of a project proposal on "Promoting Investments in the Renewable Energy and Energy Efficiency Sectors in West Africa" which was submitted to BizClim last year. The main objective of the project was to introduce legal and regulatory reforms to promote innovative Nationally Appropriate Mitigation Actions (NAMAs) for tackling climate change and to create an enabling environment for investment and finance in mitigation actions for renewable energy and energy efficiency environmental projects in the ECOWAS region. To this end, a study was undertaken to assess the business conditions in the ECOWAS countries with a view to determining the extent to which they are suitable for the development and implementation of NAMAs. This study included field visits to five selected ECOWAS countries (Burkina Faso, Cape Verde, Ghana, Senegal and Togo).

Dr. Kappiah explained that currently the Clean Development Mechanism (CDM) and Joint Implementation (JI) programmes have been the only vehicles available under the Kyoto Protocol for the industrialized world to assist with emissions reduction in the developing nations. Unfortunately these instruments have not had the desired results due to several factors.

This is the background for investigating the potential benefits of NAMAs and to disseminate their concept to the ECOWAS member countries at various fora, including the COP17 in Durban and more recently the African Carbon Forum in Addis Ababa. This workshop provides another platform to discuss this concept in detail, and more importantly, to agree on a road map and action plan for the implementation of NAMAs within our regional context.

Dr. Kappiah concluded his address by expressing the hope that the implementation of the roadmap will facilitate investments in the regions renewable energy, energy efficiency and transport sectors.

2.1.3 Keynote Speech - Honorable Nusah Abdulai Fuseini, Deputy Minister for Energy

The keynote speech was delivered by Honorable Nusah Abdulai Fuseini, Deputy Minister for Energy.

The Deputy Minister welcomed all participants to the workshop and explained that energy remains a dominant force in driving socio-economic developments in all world economies and that the goal of African governments to eradicate poverty could never be fully realized without acknowledging and confronting this fact. Still, there are millions of people in West Africa without access to modern energy services.

As a signatory of the Kyoto protocol, Ghana is committed to supporting industrialized countries in reducing greenhouse gas emissions through mitigation actions to promote renewable energy and energy efficiency programmes.

However, the challenge has been the high cost for the development and use of renewable energy and Ghana has undertaken policy initiatives to promote and increase the contribution of renewable energy in the national energy mix. The Ministry of Energy is committed to the development of other renewable energy resources including wind, biomass and small hydropower. To that effect, a Renewable Energy Act 2011 (Act 832) has just been put in place to provide regulatory framework and incentives for encouraging the private sector to invest in renewable energy plants.

He said that ensuring energy efficiency and conservation is another policy goal of the government to reduce greenhouse emissions and that the following three main projects are being implemented:

- Efficient lighting retrofit project
- Appliance energy efficiency project
- Power factor correction project

Even though these projects are being implemented without CDM credit facilities, Ghana is taking positive steps to make climate change pivotal to development and NAMAs will be considered a priority for driving the low carbon development agenda.

The Deputy Minister concluded his address by expressing the hope that the workshop would provide practical ways and means for tackling the major challenge to leverage more capital, invest in capacities to deliver more energy and less carbon, taking full cognizance of the economic circumstance of the subregion.

2.1.4 Renewable Energy & Energy Efficiency in the ECOWAS Region - 2011 to 2016: The Role of ECREEE by Mr. Bah Saho, Renewable Energy Expert, ECREEE

Following the opening ceremony, the presentations started with: Renewable Energy & Energy Efficiency in the ECOWAS Region - 2011 to 2016: The Role of ECREEE by Mr. Bah Saho, Renewable Energy Expert, ECREEE

The speaker started his presentation by mentioning the challenges facing energy efficiency in West Africa which include low access to modern energy services, energy security concerns and climate changes mitigation and adaptation concerns

He said that in spite of the limited access to energy sources, the enormous potential for hydro, bio, solar, wind energy is still not exploited.

The existing barriers for RE and EE included among others the lack of:

- Tailored RE&EE policy, legal and regulatory frameworks;
- RE&EE quality standards and appraisal tools;
- Low capacities and RE&EE knowledge base of key groups in public and private sectors;
- Awareness of key groups in public and private sectors on different levels;
- Advocacy and lobby groups;
- Risk and investment capital and tailored financial schemes.

The speaker then went on to provide a brief overview of the background of ECREEE, its foundation, its network, partners, objectives, activities, and

strategies. He informed the group that the 2010/11 workplans of ECREEE have been implemented and that the 2012 workplan and budget have been approved.

Regarding the activities of ECREEE, the priority programmes for 2011-2016 involve regional renewable energy policy framework for the ECOWAS region with the support of the EU. They also include capacity development in the long, short and medium terms, also advocacy, awareness raising and knowledge management.

ECREEE is also involved in RE and EE investment and business promotion by developing instruments and projects for urban and rural areas. The speaker gave examples of RE and EE projects already implemented in WAF in the areas of wind, hydro, bio, waste to power and solar energy.

2.1.5 LOW Impact of CDM and Carbon Finance in WAF and implication for NAMAs by Mr. Demba Diop, Energy Expert, Team leader of the study

The presentation focused on the low impact of CDM finance and the experience with renewable energy and energy efficiency in West Africa (WAF).

It discussed the fact that the knowledge on NAMA is still very limited and the unsuccessful experiences with CDM in WAF have created a sense of disillusion and lack of trust in climate finance.

The speaker explained that the conditions for the success of NAMAs include among others:

- Improving upon existing projects/programmes by up-scaling and/or by adding new components
- Developing economies of scale, e.g. in EE in residential buildings
- Using financial benefits to reduce costs (e.g. energy savings by households)
- Monetizing external benefits (e.g. carbon, pollution, decongestion)

The speaker made the following observations and recommendations on business conditions:

- All ECOWAS countries with the exception of Ghana rank in the bottom third of the World bank ranking on the 'doing business' index;
- The scores on the 10 components and sub-indicators provide suggestions for improvements;
- Important steps can be made, as is shown by the 'single window' established in Togo for all domestic and foreign companies interested in starting a business there;
- As far as known, none of the ECOWAS countries has been excluded by any
 of the international and regional development banks from their lending
 operations for reasons of macro-economic instability or otherwise
- In several meetings the importance of proper regulations was acknowledged but not stressed and rather the relevance of their implementation was emphasized.

Regarding the requirements under the UNFCCC and attitudes towards CDM and NAMAs, he explained that all ECOWAS countries have fulfilled the formal requirements and are thus able to engage in CDMs and NAMAs even though they

have not be successful in attracting CDM finance projects. Therefore there is a sense of disillusion and resentment, both with respect to CDM and towards RE projects in general, as many of them have failed.

In conclusion, the speaker provided a review of the situation in Africa showing a decline in ODA from western countries and subsequently Africa's reduced dependency on it in favour of foreign private investments and Diaspora remittances.

2.1.6 NAMAs: examples, conditions and situation in WAF with emphasis on FIT by Mr. Martin Zwanenburg, Economist

This presentation provided an update on a report (Status Report on NAMAs, Midyear Update May 2012, ECN and Ecofys) made available on the website of the conference.

The presentation provided insights on the following subjects

Regarding business conditions

- Important steps can be made, as is shown by the 'single window' established in Togo for all domestic and foreign companies interested to start a business there
- As far as known, none of the ECOWAS countries has been excluded by any
 of the international and regional development banks from their lending
 operations for reasons of macro-economic instability or otherwise
- Most of these organizations do not openly provide policy advice
- In several meetings the importance of proper regulations was acknowledged but not stressed and rather the relevance of their implementation was emphasized and the need not to wait for proper regulations

Regarding the requirements under the UNFCCC and attitudes towards CDM & NAMA

- All ECOWAS countries have fulfilled the formal requirements and are thus able to engage in CDMs and NAMAs
- The quality and completeness of the National Communication and the GHG Inventories included do impose limits on the sectors in which NAMAs can be formulated and on their scope and comprehensiveness
- All countries have received support in their National Communications, but partly through their involvement in these. In some countries significant domestic capacities have been developed
- ECOWAS countries have not been very successful at attracting and processing CDM projects and a strong sense of disillusion and resentment prevails, both with respect to CDM and towards RE projects in general, as many of them failed for a variety of reasons
- The poor experience with CDM is carried over towards negative expectations towards NAMA and especially towards the MRV requirements

Regarding selection and conditions for NAMAs to promote RE&EE

- Several NAMAs are under development and examples are important in learning by doing and in shaping and further defining the NAMA concept
- Conditions required for NAMAs are partly general and partly specific

- A strong consensus is developing on important general conditions, such as linkage to national planning and LEDS and stakeholders consultations
- The specific conditions relate mostly to the sector and to the country
- From the example NAMAs on RE&EE the FIT (Feed-in-Tariff) NAMA is suitable to most ECOWAS countries and FIT efforts are made in several countries
- A strong consensus is developing on important specific technical and regulatory conditions for a FIT to operate and for a FIT NAMA, the additional requirement to have a reference/BAU unit costs per kWh
- The experience in Ghana shows that both for the legislation and the FIT, details and consistency are important and price ranges are still broad
- Experience in several ECOWAS countries shows that neither the specific legislation nor the FIT are necessary for the implementation of 'feed-ins'
- NAMAs can be developed to help establish the best conditions for a FIT

The following <u>approaches</u>, <u>options</u> and <u>suggestions</u> for discussion were provided by the presenter:

- Amongst NAMA developers the approach is to develop pilots and learn by doing without waiting for negotiations on NAMAs to be completed
- A similar approach is suggested and practiced in many ECOWAS countries with respect to national legislation and regulation
- There is a growing consensus on 'ideal conditions' for NAMAs, but at the same time a pilot NAMA under development in Ghana shows the possibility to develop an EE NAMA with only a limited number of stakeholders, which all stand to gain and without any other party to loose
- A UNDP report recently published for Togo describes what should be done
 in terms of capacity and institution building and coordination between
 them to establish the ideal conditions and processes for NAMAs
- Experience with broad capacity building for CDM has shown the deficiencies with such a broad approach and may increase the disillusion related both to the long-flat learning curve and to the continuing new insights & practices.

2.1.7 The role of NAMA in financing a sustainable knowledge society in Cape Verde by Dr. Michael Knaus, IFAS

The speaker started his presentation by introducing the Institute for applied Material Flow Management (http://www.stoffstrom.org) and the Environmental Campus Birkenfeld, where IfaS is located, which are sterling example of zero-emission facilities. He then provided a review of the Cape Verdean 100% renewable energy master plan during which he explained the energy situation in the country and why fossils are not a solution but rather an economic burden. The master plan aims to promote the development of renewable energy projects in Cape Verde by achieving 25% renewable energy penetration in 2012; 50% in 2020 and on one island (Brava) attain 100% penetration of renewables. By 2011 already, there was a penetration of 27% with the implementation of

By 2011 already, there was a penetration of 27% with the implementation of several wind parks and solar plants.

The speaker concluded his presentation with the following considerations:

- 50% RE is ambitious and unique in Africa but most likely not sufficient!
 - Costs for imported fuel in 2020 are still enormous and fuel supply is not safe

- 100% RE demands for more engineering intelligence provide more chances for an education-based society
- 100% RE supplied electricity means to turn 300% RE potentials in reality creating huge surplus energy which must be used in new industry/consumer chains, such as cooling warehouses, desalinated water, etc.
- Much higher investment must be organized
- NAMAs can play a significant role in finance
- No comparable, working examples to copy from!

Discussion

Following the presentations a discussion took place during which the points below were made:

- For Cape Verde there has been no role model in 100% RE to copy from. Hence, this endeavour is ground breaking.
- Regarding what happens to the current fossil fuel power installations in Cape Verde, Mr. Knaus explained that alongside with the 100% RE plans a decommission plan will be created.
- In order to implement 100% RE in Cape Verde over a 20 year period it was explained that 50 to 60% (per cent) of the investment goes directly into the renewable energy technologies while 30-40% will be invested in infrastructure (energy storage, grid transmission and operation, etc.) and up 10% will be spend for capacity building (academic and non-academic training).
- Speaking to the question to know the institutional structure mandated to work on the NAMAs within the various ministries, one of the participants explained that currently NAMAs are covered by the Ministry of Environment in her country (Côte d'Ivoire). It is difficult to identify a structure to manage NAMAs. The regulatory framework is not very clear in Côte d'Ivoire and until it is clarified, the ministry in charge of environment is responsible for NAMAs. In Togo, the Directorate for the Environment is the focal point for NAMAs issues and activities. In Ghana, the Ministry of Environment is in charge of coordinating and DNAs are providing support.
- One of the participants expressed concern about the fact that no specific documentation is available on NAMAs and wanted to know on what basis the proposals are made since most of our countries are currently developing their national policies. He argued that to formulate sustainable projects they need to be based on national priorities and policies. In answering, it was said that NAMAs are supposed to be nationally appropriate. This is a chance for Africans to contribute (this was not the case with the CDMs which were mainly imposed from outside) to providing their own solutions to their problems. There is a need to identify the challenges and difficulties we experienced in the CDMs and try to fix them to be able to take full advantage of NAMAs.
- On the meaning of 'appropriate technologies for Africa' and the actions that ECREEE is taking to advise West African governments to subsidize renewable energy for the grassroots, it was contributed that 'appropriate' refers to what is appropriate in the national context. Regarding ECREEE's actions they include: sensitization, capacity building, advocacy, education. However these are not enough and measures are being taken at the policy level.

- Measures taken by governments to facilitate 'doing business' in their respective countries can be an incentive for private investors. Ghana has made a lot of reforms to facilitate private investment in renewable energy.
- Regarding what can be done if countries have not put in place measures or reforms to facilitate private investment in the area of renewable energy, it was said that ECREEE has started developing a new regional energy policy and once completed it will be validated at ECOWAS level for adoption by the various countries in the region. It was also added that investors would need guarantees on non-interference from governments to encourage their investments
- It was argued that NAMAs are not as simple as they appear and that there is a need for a clearer argument in favour of NAMAs at national level. In that respect ECREEE has prepared an action plan that will be presented later on during the workshop.
- Regarding the WAAP Observatory it was said that it is still not operational.
 In case it becomes operational, it will complement the ECREEE observatory, which is involved in renewable energy.

2.1.8 Early Experiences in the Development of Pilot NAMAs: Private Sector Involvement & Scaling Up Installation of Capacitor Banks by Mr. Daniel Tutu, EPA Ghana, and Kofi Agyarko, Energy Commission, Ghana

The first speaker explained that the presentation aimed at sharing with participants the early lessons learned in the development of NAMAs in Ghana.

He stressed that NAMAs is complex in nature and still evolving as was made evident during the previous presentations and discussions.

In the case of Ghana, Mr. Tutu, emphasized that the population has been linked to economic growth of the country and that development is heavily dependent on natural resources.

He explained that even though the country's emissions are relatively low, future trends are a cause for concern and should prompt action, especially in view of emissions from households and the transport sector which account for over half of all emissions in the country.

The question for the country is to be able to combine foreign aid and national budgeting in order to develop capacity and reduce emissions. To that effect, the country aims at making use of the existing global mechanisms to decarbonize national development.

Regarding the NAMAs, there is a need to link and anchor them to the development agenda of the country and three parallel processes were expanded on to that effect. The speaker explained the process from elaborating the policy to the piloting and implementation phase of the NAMA.

The second speaker explained that within the framework of the renewable energy act, there are promising areas for example for greater enabled environment, policy, experience, financing. A number of energy efficiency actions are ongoing and capacitor bank installations are under way and looking promising.

In the energy sector, the Renewable energy Act (Act 832) has been passed. Ways are being devised to increase the efficiency of charcoal for example.

In a bid to develop an Investment guide, there will be a need to synthesize critical information on climate mitigation action into a one-stop-shop pot, adopt a processed-based and participatory process, provide practical information on technical risks, barriers and solutions; provide an online platform and quarterly disclosure of investment outlook, a strong partnership with Ghana Investment Promotion Council and NBSSI (National Board for Small Scale Industry) platform.

In conclusion, the speaker provided the following lessons and challenges for the Ghana experience:

- Lack of clarity of how typical NAMAs would look like. Learning by doing & taking baby steps.
- What financing model would fit?
- Under capacity issues (human, institutional) including coordination and efficiencies. Promotion: ability to attract right investments
- Non-competitive bureaucracies. Which institution does what and gives what approvals at what stage? Who is to monitor and report what?
- Environmental integrity? Mode for proving additionality? Suppressed demand issues?
- Risks associated with unpredictable nature of NAMAs

2.1.9 Current NAMA developments and Kenya case study by Mr. Xander van Tilburg, Expert, ECN

The presenter started his presentation by giving an overview of ECN, a Dutch energy R&D institute with strong international connections which serves as a bridge between energy research and the market by developing high quality knowledge and technology for the transition to sustainable energy management. He explained that ECN has published a number of papers on NAMAs including the NAMA status report mid-year update.

The report made the following recommendations by NAMAs practitioners:

- Continued bottom-up exchange on developing and piloting NAMAs
- Learning from the long history of development activities
- Clear and transparent criteria for fundable NAMA proposals
- Concrete and clear examples of MRV of different types of NAMAs
- Practical experience to demonstrate how the private sector can be involved in NAMA finance

The speaker then provided a view of NAMAs from the perspectives of the private sector, the national governments, and in the negotiating text.

The speaker stressed that as government interventions or actions, NAMAs involve feed-in tariffs, credit facilities as well as laws, everything that would enable the private sector to do business in an environmentally friendly manner. He explained that NAMAs are government interventions targeted at creating an enabling environment.

In Kenya, ECN is helping the government to develop NAMAs and an action plan is currently being developed. The speaker stressed that the support and strong

leadership of the Permanent Secretary and the Minister are proving highly instrumental in pushing this agenda forward. Thanks to that support, the country has already prepared five strong NAMAs proposals.

Mr. van Tilburg concluded his presentation by providing the practical steps in preparing a NAMA proposal:

- Define the rationale behind the action
- Clarify:
 - o the role of co-benefits and alignment with NDP
 - Incremental costs and additionality
 - o International vs. national support
- Clarify the role of the private sector
- Engage with potential donors and investors
- Identify gaps and barriers and chose the appropriate public finance mechanism
- Develop a concrete financial proposal

2.1.10 NAMAs and Private Sector Involvement; Maximizing the chances to leverage private investment by Ms. Caroline de Vit, Expert, ECOFYS

The objective of this presentation was to explain how to attract private investment in the context of NAMAs.

The presenter started her presentation with an overview of Ecofys, a leading consultancy in renewable energy, energy & carbon efficiency, energy systems & markets and energy & climate policy with the motto "Sustainable energy for everyone".

Caroline stressed three facts, which, she believes should be acknowledged:

- 1. There is currently a lack of financial and technological support for least developed countries in the area of climate mitigation projects, especially African countries
- 2. Private sector support is needed to stabilize the temperature increase by 2 degrees
- 3. Private monies are already flowing to developing countries but their tangibility remains uncertain.

In that respect, she explained that NAMAs could contribute to making the financial support more tangible by offering the opportunity to attract private investments.

The presenter then explained the case of the E-mobility readiness plan in Chile where the government is committed to a low and zero emission vehicle policy and where the goal is 70,000 electric vehicles on the road by 2020. The plan is however faced with a few challenges in the areas of market, technology and policy.

Another study case involving the production of clean energy in the Kakheti region in Eastern Georgia was developed with the objective of constructing 10 hydro power plants. In order to facilitate this process, favourable measures, policies and regulations have been put in place.

She concluded her presentation with the following summary:

- A NAMA is meant to lead to transformational changes, e.g. fossil-fuel vs. renewables
- Business as usual is often sustained by a complex combination of policies and practices from many stakeholders
- Engaging with all stakeholders is key to positively impact business conditions
- A NAMA development process could offer 3 ways to maximize chances to attract private investment for mitigation actions:
 - 1. a single entry point for engaging dialogues
 - 2. a policy framework in which specific measures to lower some investment barriers can be undertaken
 - 3. an acceptable level of policy certainty for private investors.

2.1.11 How to finance NAMAs? International challenges and their consequences by Mr. Romain Morel, Consultant, CDC Climate Research, France

The presenter first briefly presented CDC Climate, a Caisse des Dépôts' subsidiary launched in 2010 to tackle climate change as a long term investor. The main three activities of the subsidiary involve equity investments and advisory, investments in carbon assets and Research in climate change economics.

The presenter identified the three pillars of NAMAs, namely: Access to capital; International recognition and Use of economic tools.

The presenter explained that financial flows towards developing countries exist and can take different forms. Donors, whether public or private, finance recipients through loans, equities, etc. to implement actions that can be translated into NAMAs. He stressed that developing countries need to find a way to raise money for their climate policy.

He explained that the European proposal for a new market mechanism could be used to offset national climate policies and that offsets mechanisms can work only if there is a demand.

The presenter concluded his presentation with the following three main points:

- NAMAs implementation will face huge challenges
- But for developing countries it is a way of rethinking international support
- NAMAs are flexible enough to be adaptable to local contexts

2.1.12 Togo case study on Identifying the capacity and institutional needs for NAMAs by Pr. Ayite-Lo Ajavon Nse, Togo

The presenter explained that the objective of the study was to identify the gaps and needs in terms of capacity in formulating development strategy to reduce carbon emissions (SDFEC/LEDS) and engage in the process of mitigation measures.

The methodology used was based on a comprehensive review of the national situation relating to mitigation measures and on consultations with stakeholders either through field visits or in the framework of regional or national workshops.

The presenter elaborated on the views of stakeholders during the consultations conducted and these involved, among others, the lack of information on climate change, on the various opportunities and funding mechanisms derived from the UNFCCC.

The consultations concluded that local skills and knowledge are necessary. To that effect, local experts should be involved in designing mitigation measures.

The opportunities and priorities for Togo to engage in NAMAs include data collection, studies, and research.

2.1.13 Financing and Investing in Mitigation Actions in West Africa by Paul van Aalst, SOVEC Management BV

The presenter outlined the ambitions and philosophy of SOVEC, which are to:

- Alleviate poverty
- Stimulate local entrepreneurship
- Mobilize capital to invest in development
- Combine good social and financial returns

The two pillars of SOVEC's approach, local partnership and entrepreneurs for entrepreneurs have proved to be key success factors.

The presenter explained that Africa is an emerging market, hence the emphasis and attention it has garnered from SOVEC. In Africa, SOVEC has chosen to enter the Ghanaian market because of its political stability, its good economic development, its business climate, which is open for investments and its cultural fitness.

The speaker also presented the status of SOVEC as at May 2012.

He explained that SOVEC is interested in making profit while contributing to the development of the countries in which it invests and it does that through financing SMEs. SOVEC provides hands-on support to its partners. In that respect, NAMAs represent a great opportunity for SOVEC to contribute to a clean development . NAMAs can lead to improved regulatory frameworks and can provide subsidies to defray the extra costs of first-time deals.

Discussion

 Regarding foreign private investment, a lot of incentive measures have been set up in some African countries and it was said that NAMAs can contribute to removing barriers for investments with a climate mitigation aspect. Some conditions related mainly to co-benefits that need to be clarified. All these conditions could in themselves constitute a NAMA. Examples could be FITs, Concessions and standard PPA. Financial tools can be used to mitigate the risks especially in developing countries. Having an institutional, legal and regulatory framework in place is important to mitigate the risks. In some countries however such as Cape Verde, because of its island structure, renewable energy efforts are under way while virtually no regulations exist, while in other countries (e.g. Senegal) regulations are in place but no investment have been made in RE.

- The initial costs of setting up a business could be subsidized especially in fragile states to encourage foreign investment.
- The private sector in West Africa does not have a good picture of what NAMAs are. There is a need to implement NAMAs so that they are translated into business principles and regular business practices, for them to be able to take advantage of the opportunities offered by NAMAs. For example, a feed-in tariff for renewable energy is a NAMA (from the climate point of view) but it is just a regular and crucial investment condition for businesses.
- Regarding the process of NAMAs, views differed as to whether there was an agreed-on format/methodology or not. Some of the participants were of the view that each country has to decide what is appropriate for its own context. Others were of the view that supported NAMAs would be ideal instead of leaving each country to decide its own approach. It was agreed that NAMAs are intended to be commercially viable proposals in order to secure funding.
- It was emphasized that developing nations are not the main contributors to gas emissions and are not likely to be in the near future. In that sense NAMAs are a form of support by the rest of the world to support a more sustainable growth path in developing markets. This is an opportunity that could be seized to help reduce emissions, because, even though African countries do not contribute significantly to greenhouse gas emissions, they should benefit from solutions developed and implemented elsewhere to solve this problem. Countries should get involved in NAMAs and therefore they need to understand them and develop plans to benefit from them.
- Africa is growing fast and investing very rapidly in education, urbanization, energy, and these are areas that need private sector investments to increase competitiveness of African countries. NAMAs are an opportunity for Africa to do just that. A very effective NAMA could for example focus on improved cook stoves and there is a huge opportunity to be exploited in this area.

2.2 DAY TWO: TUESDAY 5 JUNE 2012

2.2.1 ECREEE road map for developing NAMA capacities and actions in the ECOWAS sub-region by Mr. Demba Diop, Energy Expert

The objective of the presentation was to obtain feedback from participants on the roadmap for developing NAMA capacities and actions in the ECOWAS sub-region.

On the barriers facing NAMAs, there was mentioned the need to forge a regional understanding on NAMAs and addressing the policy gaps and financial needs. The type of NAMA actions to be developed in the sub-region and the potential roles of NAMAs in order to boost the RE&EE market were also explained.

The presenter explained that only Ghana has been involved in consultations and workshops to raise awareness on the issue of NAMAs.

Finally the presenter provided an outline of an ECREEE climate change facility and the ECREEE action plan for NAMA development in the region. The action plan includes the following actions:

- Action 1: Capacity Building to undertake NAMAs actions
- Action 2: Policy Support
- Action 3: Finance
- Action 4: Market Development
- Action 5: Knowledge Management and R&D

Discussion

After the presentation of the road map, reactions and feedback were sought from the participants. The road map analysed the main barriers and gaps preventing West Africa to attract CDM and other carbone finance and the low development of RE and EE and provided an outline of the what need to be done to remedy by proposing the creation of an ECREEE climate change facility and an action plan for such facility. The following contributions were made:

- There is a need to identify and emphasize the role of DNAs in taking the lead at national level. DNAs are hosted by the Ministry of Environment. It was mentioned that some of the DNA were not properly trained and while other do not share properly information with the other governments such as the ministry of energy, transport, agriculture etc..
- Capacity buildings training of one or two days as mentioned by the expert are not enough. Therefore more extensive sessions should be considered to obtain the desired results of improving knowledge on the NAMAs. The document already proposed local workshops and the efforts made so far are commendable but should be improved on and should be a continuous process. To that effect, basic tools are needed. However these tools have not yet been put in place since consultations are still underway at the Conference of Parties to properly identify NAMAs. For the time being each country can identify projects to reduce greenhouse gas emissions.
- There is a need to clarify the mode of interaction between the NFIs (National Focus Institutions) and DNAs to achieve the objective of NAMAs.
- The five projects mentioned in the road map are regional and are transferable in each country of the ECOWAS region.
- Point 2 of the proposals suggests training people from various ministries but none from the Ministry of Finance. The role of this ministry is crucial. Other ministries such as those in charge of agriculture should also be involved to improve the efficiency of NAMAs since environmental issues are crosscutting. In a national process, all the relevant ministries (Agriculture, industry, mines, finance, transport, etc.) should be added. However, the ministry in charge of the environment should take the lead and coordinate.

Consensus achieved

- Focus on regional NAMAs instead of national ones (regional NAMAs interesting to AfDB and also discussed at ECOWAS/UNDP NAMA workshops in 2010 & 2011, both in Accra)
- Suggestions to include agriculture (& forestry) as it is the main source of livelihood for majority of rural poor

- o Expanding regional and national training on RETSCREEN tools to help countries design projects on a standard basis.
- Importance of developing guidelines for the region. Suggestion to search for and make use of existing guidelines and those possibly in pipeline (sources like AfDB, UNFCCC, ...) . An ECREEE 'helpdesk' has been mentioned
- Need for longer training (week(s) instead of day(s)) and in phases (intro, concept notes, prioritization, full proposal, ready for registry, implementation) with 'homework' in between and check on results & progress. Capacity building should be a continuous process, also because of new developments and emerging agreements on templates, formats & procedures
- Emphasis on developing the DNA capacity first, only then process can start moving'. Developing a positive role of ECREEEs NFIs broad) stakeholder involvement
- NAMAs about removing barriers, creating an enabling environment and to proceed with 'learning-by-doing' approach, but with more emphasis on learning and sharing, also from other regions (e.g. Kenya).
- Need for stronger role of Ministry of finance and link required with lower levels of government in order to match to match the general procedures to define appropriateness at national level. The link with poverty & livelihood is required.
- o Ongoing policies & projects can be included in NAMA and 'repackaged'

It was agreed that the road map be adapted taking into account the comments and observations made.

2.2.2 Financing and investment in mitigation actions in Africa: the AfDB experience by Dr. Nogoye Thiam, Climate Change Expert, AfDB

The presenter outlined the AfDB's strategy in the area of climate change.

She explained that climate changes pose a new challenge for most of AfDB's projects and programmes. Therefore, the Bank has decided to include climate change mitigation measures in its development projects and programmes and has formulated an action plan based on three pillars: low carbon impact development, climate resilient development, financing tools.

Regarding the first pillar on low carbon impact development, the Bank plans to increase its investments to tap into Africa's abundant clean energy resources (hydro, wind and solar energy), to support energy efficiency initiatives, to promote sustainable and low-carbon transport, and to accelerate investments in sustainable land and forestry management.

The second pillar involves sustainable land and water resources management, the strengthening of key infrastructure and urban system resilience.

The third pillar, Regional Members Countries (RMCs) will be assisted to mobilize concessionary resources in order to implement their climate change initiatives. The Bank is hosting and administering special funds. For example, the *Congo Basin Forest Fund* (CBFF) is based at the Bank and received an initial grant of GBP 100 million from the UK and Norway Governments to protect forests in the Congo Basin.

To implement its action plan to combat climate change, the Bank will invest approximately 6 billion UA (about 9 billion of dollars US) in the energy, transport, water, agriculture sectors over the next five years (2011-2015).

During her presentation, Mrs. Thiam stressed the fact that developing projects/programmes with low carbon impact is an opportunity that African countries should take advantage of. She then gave examples of low carbon impact project/programmes.

Regarding AfDB's support to NAMAs, the presenter explained that it is in the form of:

- Providing a platform to African negotiators to understand NAMAs
- Providing technical and financial support to formulate concrete NAMAs proposals
- Producing technical documents and information notes on formulating NAMAs and REDD
- Providing support to RMCs to develop methodologies for reduction measures

For the past year, the Bank has been consulting on how to support NAMAs and actions have been implemented and are ongoing.

In conclusion, the presenter talked of the support that the Bank intends to provide to selected countries to develop their NAMAs, put in place an MRV system, recording their NAMAs for implementation.

2.2.3 NAMAs, Climate finance and Investments by Sean Doolan, DFID Ghana

The presenter started his presentation by stating that the private sector in Africa is faced with real challenges and issues.

He explained that it is important for local commercial expertise to frame the issues of financing NAMAs. The investments need to be commercially viable and should use various blended instruments. The issue for Africa is not really to reduce the emissions but rather lower the rate of growth in emissions.

Most climate strategies are the initiatives of the Ministry of Environment while other ministries such as those in charge of agriculture, energy, etc. are not aware. In the case of NAMAs, all these other stakeholders should be included in the formulation to make sure there are profitable for all.

Funding will depend on whether the programmes/projects can achieve results.

A couple of long term principles should be taken into consideration in formulating NAMAs.

- Public authorities should be involved from the onset
- The programme should be long term (between 10-20 years) to be able to really see the results. It should also be consistent and coherent.

The principles to take into account are:

- Early and ongoing managed dialogue needed with institutional investors and local and international private sector
- Clear, long term and coherent policy and regulatory framework
- Price signals in market to support development of low carbon alternatives
- Ensure social costs of transition are well managed
- Underpinning economic drivers need alignment to support sustainable growth
- National governments need active programmes of public (climate) finance to support, underpin and develop investment grade projects that mobilize private capital

Discussion

- A comment was made on the fact that guidelines for the preparation of NAMAs have been prepared but have not been adopted by the Conference of Parties
- Regarding the apparent lack of investment by the AfDB in waste management, the AfDB expert explained that waste recycling is part of the areas covered by the Bank. There are AfDB supported projects for example in Kenya on waste to power. A case study was also conducted on waste management in the framework of AfDB's support to NAMAs. There are private sector supported projects all over Africa in this area since the Bank cannot be involved in small projects.
- The climate change issue has been developing in the past decade and governments should be fixing the rules of the game by setting long term objectives.
- AfDB supported countries to conduct consultations at national level to come up with NAMA proposals to UNFCCC. These consultations resulted in the nine country reports that have been finalized. The countries are now to be supported in moving to the next step to concretize these proposals. The Bank intervenes in financing the process, all the activities, paying the consultants and organizing restitution workshops. The country is responsible for formulating its own programmes and paying its consultants. The bank does not yet finance energy information systems but supports countries in obtaining reliable energy information. The SEFA (Sustainable Energy Fund for Africa) was received by the AfDB (56 million dollars from the Danish government) for the development of renewable energy in Africa. The various countries are therefore invited to start developing projects and programmes to benefit from this fund.
- Many of the investment areas do not necessarily need to bear the NAMA label as long as they involve clean environment development strategies. Clean cook stoves are a good example of this. Most of the AfDB capacity development programmes are funded by DFID. Another programme on training of trainers is currently underway in collaboration with DFID.
- Regarding training of trainers ECREEE is involved in training two persons by country who in turn replicate the training to a wider audience at national level. ECREEE is envisaging to team up with DFID and AfDB to conduct more of these ToTs.
- Rural based financing is an emerging area. Baseline reporting and evaluation are important and should be set from the beginning.

- The funding of small projects that are too small-scale for DFID and AfDB to fund, was recognized as a challenge. However, it was pointed out that financial intermediaries who help package project and programmes together could be approached to link smaller projects to big projects that have an environmental aspect.
- On the issues and challenges faced by the nine countries in formulating NAMA proposals, it was mentioned that the main challenge was to formulate proposals that meet sustainable development needs and are environmentally friendly.
- As regards the institution the most appropriate to fund micro hydropower plants, it was said that for the AfDB to finance a project, it needs to be in the national development strategy and go through the approval process for projects.

2.2.4 Closing Ceremony

Mr. Kappiah then closed the workshop by thanking all for their participation. He acknowledged that the concept of NAMAs is still a bit confusing but that the process of understanding it and applying it in the various ECOWAS countries has been initiated and needs to be pursued.

He informed participants that the roadmap will be amended taking into account the observations made during the discussions. The roadmap was therefore adopted in principle and will be disseminated to participants after inclusion of the amendments.

He finally invited those interested, to visit the biogas-plant built by Mr. John Idan of Biogas Technologies Africa Limited for the hotel (African Regent). For more information check www.biogasonline.com.

2.2.5 Main outcomes of the Workshop

On the Road Map and Action Plan

- The ECREEE Road Map and Action Plan have been approved by the all participants; provided that the recommendations are incorporated in the final form with increased attention on capacity building and training.
- ECREEE is given mandate by the participants (mostly government representatives) to undertake actions for developing the capacities of the ECOWAS countries members. There is a clear need for developing NAMA capacity in the Region. This need was voiced by all the West African participants. ECREEE is called to play a leading role in assisting countries DNA, experts and other stakeholders to develop the required skills in promoting NAMAs.
- Both the African Development Bank and DFID (UK) are interested to provide financial assistance for NAMA capacity building in the Region. Assistance should be provided to ECREEE to draft a viable proposal for the African Development Bank and DFID.
- During the field mission, all the EU representatives visited in West Africa showed interest in supporting a NAMA proposal if it originates from the Ministry of Finance of the concerned countries. Therefore, DNA should work closely with their respective Ministries of Finance to access the potential EU support.

 The results of the analysis of energy policy, legislation and regulations – especially in relation to the FIT – can be fed into the ongoing policy work, as undertaken by ECREEE as one of its core focus areas.

On others issues

- Building capacity should go hand in hand with making resources available to national focal points to enable them conduct activities to raise awareness at national level. About five countries have already conducted their trainings and others are preparing theirs. ECREEE has provided support in that respect. The DNAs should be the first to fully understand the concept of NAMAs to be able to lead the process at national level.
- There is a need to review the actions proposed to ascertain those that are feasible.
- The Monrovia Meeting on hydro power made some interesting strategy and policy proposals that could be useful in enriching the document
- Regarding social impact of projects and programmes, it is pivotal. There are issues relating to the bankability of projects from the point of view of investors, however, their social impact is of essence for development partners and governments. There should be coordination between the NFIs and DNAs to produce NAMAs.
- ECREEE should produce a policy brief (2-3 pages) and make it available in all the necessary languages to facilitate the work of the focal points and help in understanding NAMAs among stakeholders.
- Regarding the criteria ECREEE will use to ascertain which NAMA is appropriate for each country, it was said that the objective of the meeting was not to review all types of NAMAs but concentrate on Energy and Transport sector. It does not belong to ECREEE to decide what is appropriate for one country or decide which institution will coordinate NAMAs at national level. ECREEE is interested in ensuring that the proposal is feasible and that an institution is designated as coordinator and counterpart.
- The Monrovia workshop was a huge success. The Swiss Development Corporation has expressed interest in the programme formulated by that workshop and will probably provide its support by the end of the year. EnergyPlus of Norway has also expressed interest in supporting this programme. The consensus at this workshop will also be published and support will be sought.
- There is no fixed procedure to start a NAMA. The UNFCCC has set up a registry and requested countries to register. Except for the South African and Mexican NAMAs, none is actually being implemented. There are templates and action lists on how to start a NAMA. It could start from an idea. Alternatively, the country can communicate with ECREEE and inform them on their proposal in order to obtain their assistance. A fund has been put in place at ECREEE to assist countries in conducting workshops to raise awareness on NAMAs.
- Regarding the way to appropriate regional projects at national level, it was said that it would depend on the type of project since not all projects can have a regional character.
- The COP group on technology transfer has elaborated a document that could be used gainfully.
- The lack of guidelines for the implementation and funding of NAMAs is a gap that creates confusion among participants and should be addressed.

- The concept of NAMAs is not new. There have already been mitigation measures undertaken by countries at national level. These existing projects could be reprised in the framework of NAMAs and countries could request for support for these projects.
- o Ghana is a good example of internal consultations on the issue of NAMAs.
- A comprehensive guide to NAMAs should be developed to help with improving the knowledge of all on the concept.

Undecided issues;

Focus "What type of NAMAs should be prioritised?"; 'bankability' versus 'social impact'





